

Appendix A – First Tranche Traffic Officer Vehicles – 2003/4

It was decided in July 2003 and against a first vehicle delivery date of January 2004 that the fleet would be procured on a lease basis.

The preference being to utilize government frameworks that had been procured via EO procedures and competitive tender. The framework operated by the then Inland Revenue for contract hire of vehicles met this requirement.

Lloyds TSB Autolease (LTSBA) were selected from the framework as they were the only independent organization and therefore had the capability to freely approach the market and source vehicles from any manufacturer.

LTSBA were requested to undertake a pricing trawl using the Highways Agency's vehicle specification as the baseline.

LTSBA approached 17 manufacturers, of which only 7 replied and from this number only 5 offered 4x4 vehicles. These included:

- Ford
- Land Rover
- Mitsubishi
- Toyota
- Volvo.

The attached explain the issues considered and recommendations taken forward.


**Highways Agency Traffic Officer Vehicle
Procurement Comparison**

Manufacturer	Range Rover	Range Rover Diesel Auto	Discovery	Mitsubishi	Mitsubishi	Land Cruiser	Vaux
Model	Ranger	Range Rover Diesel Auto	Discovery	Shogun LWB 3.2 DID Classic	Shogun Sport 2.5TD Equippe	Land Cruiser	Xc70 Est 2.4D5
Compliance Exceptions	The Ranger is a double cab pick-up vehicle, and not seen as preferable to a full-bodied 4x4 No all fuel variant. Non-compliant with EuroNcap. No adj front seats	3. No alternative fuel variant 5. spare wheel is mounted under the rear floor	3. No alternative fuel variant 9. Non-compliant with Euro Ncap. 9. "Marginal" Thatcham whiplash rating 9. No Euro Ncap pedestrian rating 11.1 - Steering column one way adjustable 11 No dvr seat height adjustment	Vehicle Access 2.2 - Access to drivers seat from passenger door obstructed by transmission tunnel 2.3 - 3rd row removable 2nd row folds down Performance & Stability 3.8 - Cannot operate on alternative fuels, diesel only 3.10 - Cannot operate on alternative fuels, diesel only 9. Safety - non-compliant with EuroNcap Security 10.5 - No independent lock for boot Driver comfort 11.1 - Steering column one way adjustable 11.4 - Built in lumbar support not adjustable, Police drivers say no need	Vehicle Access 2.2 - Access to drivers seat from passenger door obstructed by transmission tunnel 2.3 - Rear seats fold flat or can be unbolted Performance & Stability 3.3 - Maximum towing capacity (braked trailer) 2,800kg Emergency Equipment 5.3 - No spare tyre on LPG version. liquid repair supplied instead Safety 9.13 - Centre belt in back is a lap belt non-compliant with EuroNcap Security 10.5 - No independent lock for boot Driver comfort 11.1 - Steering column one way adjustable 11.4 - Built in lumbar support	N/A	No interior extra mirror, due to air bag, no anti-shatter membranes no run lock system.
Retail Price to public	NA			£26,059.00	£19,796.40	£25,513.00	na
Fleet Price	£14,641.03	£27,500	£20,400	£22,177.87	£18,763.85	£21,114.89	£22,003.00
Fleet Discount	25%	na	na	25%	25%	14%	15%
Delivery Charge	incl	incl	incl	incl	incl	£404.25	Inclusive
VAT	NA					£3,248.53	
Lead Time (weeks)	NA	12 weeks	8 weeks	Mitsubishi keep 3 months stock cover in this country. If Mitsubishi can be provided with an order schedule, then or usual quoted 10 to 15 working days will not be a problem. This is the delivery time from order to the one-stop-shop. If the vehicle is to be fitted with standard HA parts then this can be turned around in 5 working days. Assuming that stock of parts and vehicles are in this country (no problem if we can have a guide on HA requirements) then delivery will be within 5 weeks	Mitsubishi keep 3 months stock cover in this country. If Mitsubishi can be provided with an order schedule, then or usual quoted 10 to 15 working days will not be a problem. This is the delivery time from order to the one-stop-shop. If the vehicle is to be fitted with standard HA parts then this can be turned around in 5 working days. Assuming that stock of parts and vehicles are in this country (no problem if we can have a guide on HA requirements) then delivery will be within 5 weeks	6 - 8 Weeks	12 weeks
Appendix 1 equipment	£2,004.88	£1,545	£1,545	£1525 liv+lighting	£1525 liv+lighting	£2,322.74	na
Livery	incl	incl	incl	NA	NA	£758.72	na
Light Bar (Fitted) 48"	incl	incl	incl	NA	NA	£974.32	
Light Bar (Fitted) 39"				NA	NA	£941.70	
On-Site Service charge	na	na	na	NA	NA	N/A	N/A
Coll & Delivery Service charge				0 to 10 miles £0, 10 to 20 miles £15, 20 to 30 miles £30 30 to 40 miles £45, etc...	0 to 10 miles £0, 10 to 20 miles £15 20 to 30 miles £30 30 to 40 miles £45, etc...	N/A	N/A
Night Servicing	na	yes	yes	NA	NA	N/A	N/A
Off-peak Servicing	na	yes	yes	NA	NA	N/A	N/A
Fleet Management Charge	na	na	na	incl	incl	Inclusive	Inclusive
Tyre Replacement Charge	na	na	na	incl	incl	Inclusive	Inclusive
Glass Replacement Charge	na	na	na	incl	incl	cost of Glass	at cost
Breakdown/Recovery Charge	na	na	na	incl	incl	Inclusive	Inclusive
Accident Management Charge	na	na	na	incl	incl	Inclusive	Inclusive
Fuel Card Charge	na	na	na	incl	incl	N/A	N/A
Total Monthly Hire Charge 2 yrs ex VAT	£302.97	£1,166.19	£1,127.36	£1,115.41	£1,013.70	To Follow	£398.99
Notes to be supplied in white, and fitted with ICE.							
Other Supplier Agreements will be acceptable.							
Radio / CD Player						Standard	

First Tranche Traffic Officer Vehicles - Model Range Comparison

Model Range

Double Cab 4X4's

Ford Ranger	£903
Mitsubishi L200	
Toyota Hi Lux	£1,002

All models comprise 4x4 drive with a double cab arrangement to facilitate driver/co-driver + passenger accommodation and a separate pick up bed to carry equipment. To meet our specification the pick up bed would require a separate top box, which would impact on rear visibility. They offer potential savings in terms of annual lease and lower overall running costs when compared to a conventional 4X4 vehicle. Of these however the Ford Ranger is the worst match, in compliance terms, set against our specification. The Mitsubishi and Toyota are slightly better, but still have a level of non-compliance. Therefore for this stage of procurement they have been rejected from further consideration.

Issues:

- Questions about the suitability of this type of vehicle for IO operations, given their layout, the passenger accommodation, the elongated pick up area, the need for an additional top box.
- Questions about the security of the load carried under the top box.
- Questions about the utilitarian image.
- Questions to be addressed before these type of vehicles can be considered for use by IO's

Recommendation:

- Double cab 4X4's are omitted from the first order.
- As a vehicle range further suitability assessments should be undertaken utilising demonstrator models and an agreed testing regime, benchmarked against our specification. The opportunity will be presented to use the services of the Traffic Officers to see how such vehicles match with our specification in the field of operation.

Estate 4x4's

Volvo Xc70 Diesel	£997
Volvo Xc 70 Petrol (LPG option)	£1,066

Volvo were the only manufacturer to respond with this type of model, which offers an estate with full time 4x4 capability and potential savings in terms of annual lease and lower overall running costs when compared to a conventional 4X4 vehicle. They are however non-compliant due to lack of ride height and limited towing capacity (2000kg). Therefore for this stage of procurement they have been rejected from further consideration.




Issues:

- Questions about the suitability of this type of vehicle given level of non-compliance.
- May be suitable as an RCC "pool" car as they would offer level of a competency
- Business need for this type of vehicle has yet to be proved.

Recommendation:

- Estate 4X4's are omitted from the first order.

Mid Range 4x4 – Purchase price up to £22,000

Mitsubishi Shogun Sport Petrol (LPG option)	
Mitsubishi Shogun Sport Petrol Auto	
Mitsubishi Shogun Sport Diesel	
Land Rover Discovery Diesel	£1,127
Land Rover Discovery Diesel Auto	£1,100

Automatic and manual versions have been presented. As a match against our specification there is little to choose between the two models. It is noted that the Shogun Sport is a derivative of the pick up range but with a full estate body.

Both Sport and Discovery models offer good towing range (2800kg and 3500kg respectively). In terms of compliance the Discovery is a slightly better match against our specification, however this model is to be replaced next year. Both carry high maintenance costs, which are included in the monthly fee. There are similar questions about the suitability either model as a vehicle for TO operations. Monthly rates are similar as are running costs. Within the industry the Discovery has a questionable reliability. The Sport is not a model favoured by the Police

In terms of compliance, both models are non-compliant with our Euro NCAP safety requirements

On balance they have little more to offer in terms of compatibility against the next range of vehicles and are thus less attractive propositions.

However as model within this range further suitability assessments could be undertaken utilising demonstrator models (especially the new Discovery model in 2004) and an agreed testing regime, benchmarked against our specification. The opportunity will be presented to use the services of the Traffic Officers to see how such vehicles match with our specification in the field of operation. However it not proposed that this is taken forward at this point in time.



Issues:

- Questions over suitability
- Non compliance in key areas
- Questionable reliability

Recommendation:

- Mitsubishi Shogun Sport's are omitted from the first order
- Land Rover Discovery's are omitted from the first order

High Level 4x4's -- Purchase price over £22,000

Mitsubishi Shogun	
Mitsubishi Shogun Auto	
Land Rover Range Rover Diesel Auto	£1,166
Land Rover Range Rover Petrol Auto	£1,176
Toyota Landcruiser LC5 Diesel	£1,038
Toyota Landcruiser LC5 Diesel Auto	£1,024

These models offer the best fit against our specification, also due to their size they each offer a road presence and a professional visual image, matching similar vehicles operated on the motorway by the Police. This comes at a marginal cost premium as a range they are more expensive to lease and to run. Land Rover offer generous discounts which are passed on to us via the monthly premium. The higher residual value of the Range Rover is also reflected in the overall monthly sum

There is little to choose between each model and choice comes down to detail within the monthly sum presented. However Mitsubishi and Toyota are non-compliant with our Euro NCAP safety requirements. Mitsubishi however have submitted equivalent crash information as requested. Range Rover is not currently dual fuel compliant

Issues:

- Toyota non-compliance in key areas
- Mitsubishi do not meet Euro Ncap but have offered alternative test results

Recommendation:

- Toyota are excluded from the first order
- Land Rover -- Range Rover and Mitsubishi Shogun are considered suitable -- subject to delivery timescales
- Further dialogue is undertaken with Toyota to determine suitability of vehicles